

thinking

togetherness

ANDREJ BOŽIČ (*Ed.*)

THINKING TOGETHERNESS

PHENOMENOLOGY AND SOCIALITY

Dr. **Andrej Božič** is research fellow at the Institute Nova Revija for the Humanities (Inštitut Nove revije, zavod za humanistiko; Ljubljana, Slovenia).

The scientific monograph is published as part of the effectuation of the research program *The Humanities and the Sense of Humanity from Historical and Contemporary Viewpoints* (P6-0341), the research project *The Hermeneutic Problem of the Understanding of Human Existence and Coexistence in the Epoch of Nihilism* (J7-4631), and the infrastructure program *Center for the Promotion of the Humanities* (I0-0036).

The publication of the book is financially supported by the Slovenian Research and Innovation Agency (ARIS).

CIP - Kataložni zapis o publikaciji
Narodna in univerzitetna knjižnica, Ljubljana

165.62:316(082)

THINKING togetherness : phenomenology and sociality / Andrej Božič (ed.). -
Ljubljana : Institute Nova Revija for the Humanities, 2023. - (Humanistična zbirka
INR = The Humanities Series INR)

ISBN 978-961-7014-40-2
COBISS.SI-ID 172262659

ANDREJ BOŽIČ (Ed.)

THINKING TOGETHERNESS

PHENOMENOLOGY AND SOCIALITY

INR | INSTITUTE NOVA REVILJA
FOR THE HUMANITIES

Ljubljana 2023

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Dean Komel — Andrej Božič Thinking Togetherness. Foreword	9
---	---

PRESUPPOSITIONS AND IMPLICATIONS

Dragan Prole Sociality in the Husserlian Cave	15
---	----

Iaan Reynolds Abstraction and Self-Alienation in Mannheim and Husserl	31
---	----

Filip Borek <i>Schwingung</i> at the Heart of Phenomenon. Intersubjectivity and Phenomenality	45
---	----

TRANSCENDENTALITY AND INTERSUBJECTIVITY

Zixuan Liu What Is the Irreality of Social Reality? Higher Visibility Transcendental Intentionality	63
---	----

Noam Cohen Subjectivity as a Plurality. Parts and Wholes in Husserl's Theory of Intersubjectivity	89
---	----

Anthony Longo Intersubjectivity, Mirror Neurons, and the Limits of Naturalism	103
---	-----

Ka-yu Hui The Expressive Structure of the Person in Husserl's Social Phenomenology. From Subjective Spirit to Cultural Spiritual Shape	117
--	-----

DEVELOPMENTS AND REFINEMENTS

Liana Kryshevskaja	
The Notion of the Social World in Gustav Shpet's Conceptualization and the Ways of Phenomenology	131
Daniele Nuccilli	
Wilhelm Schapp on the Narratological Structure of Intersubjectivity	143
Daniel Neumann	
Sharing a Realistic Future. Gerda Walther on Sociality	157
Jan Strassheim	
"Passive" and "Active" Modes of Openness to the Other. Alfred Schutz's Phenomenology of Intersubjectivity	169
Andrzej Gniazdowski	
Phenomenology of the Total State by Aurel Kolnai	183
Max Schaefer	
Renewing the Erotic Relation. Michel Henry and the Lover's Night	205

COLLECTIVITY AND COMMUNITY

Marco di Feo	
The Ontological Root of Collective Intentionality	227
Lucia Angelino	
Sartre and Freud as Resources for Thinking the Genesis of a We-Perspective	241
Marco Russo	
The Theater of Appearances. Social Phenomenology of Excentricity	255
Nerijus Stasiulis	
The Ontology of Sociality	269
Dario Vuger	
On Circumlocution as Method. From Heidegger and Debord Towards a Philosophical Praxis	279
Silvia Pierosara	
Managing the Absent. On the Role of Nostalgia in Individual and Social Relations	299

PARTICULARITIES AND TOTALITARITIES

Michal Zvarík	
Socrates and <i>Polis</i> in the Thought of Jan Patočka and Hannah Arendt	313
Zachary Daus	
On the Significance of Mutual Vulnerability in Hannah Arendt's Conception of Freedom	327
Fabián Portillo Palma	
Isolation and Loneliness as Categories of Social Being. Arendt and the Origin of Totalitarian Movements	339
Gintautas Mažeikis	
Faustian Hope and Power. Bataille, Bloch, Habermas	351
Guelfo Carbone	
A Way Out of Nazism? Heidegger and the "Shepherd of Being"	365
Dean Komel	
On Totalitarium	381

7

INDIVIDUALITY AND EXPRESSIVITY

Evgeniya Shestova	
Communication in the Text Space. Phenomenology of the "Logic of Question and Answer"	401
Manca Erzetič	
The Hermeneutics of Testimony in the Context of Social Mediation	413
Andrej Božič	
"Mitsammen." Paul Celan's Poetry in the "In-Between" of (Cultural) World(s)	427
Antonia Veitschegger	
Disagreement about an Art Work's Value. Why It Is Unavoidable, What It Consists In, and How to Deal With It	443

TECHNOLOGIES AND CONTROVERSIES

Joaquim Braga	
On Don Ihde's Concept of Technological Background Relations	459
Žarko Paić	
The Body and the Technosphere. Beyond Phenomenology and Its Conceptual Matrix	475
Paolo Furia	
Uncanniness and Spatial Experience. A Phenomenological Reading of the COVID-19 Lockdown	511
AUTHORS	533
INDEX OF NAMES	539

Dean Komel — Andrej Božič

THINKING TOGETHERNESS

FOREWORD

Phenomenology has, from first foundation at the beginning of the 20th century onwards, developed into one of the mainstay streams within the comprehensive and complex landscape of contemporary philosophy: as a special and specific orientation of thinking, as a movement, which gained adherents among authors of utmost heterogeneous provenances, it has—with its under- and with its over-, as well as its counter-currents—become a richly ramified field of research that entails not only fundamental considerations concerning epistemology or ontology, but also critically and crucially touches upon—(almost) all—other realms of human—theoretical and practical—agency.

Since commencement with the works of Edmund Husserl, phenomenological philosophy has, thus, evolved from the discussions of initially maybe predominant, throughout its history continuously refined methodological issues of (—assumingly—scientifically acquired) knowledge and has, upon such a basis, come to encompass the attentive, inter- and trans-disciplinary scrutiny of a multitude of phenomena defining the horizons of humanity in the different dimensions of its worldly situatedness. However, both the tradition and the actuality of phenomenology, its miscellaneous formulations and its manifold transformations, bear witness to the circumstance that precisely the deliberation upon sociality can be observed as one of the paramount problem domains of its philosophical investigation. In effect, in fact: it is an almost staggeringly strenuous task to, at least, re-count not only all—the names of—thinkers, but also all—the names of—scientists as well as artists alike, both intellectuals as well as humanists, who can be associated with the movement either quite directly or solely indirectly, yet who, nonetheless, share the essential principles of the distinctively phenomenological approach to the question(s)—and questionability—of the social. The theoretical analyses of the

sociable character of the human being, of its capability to constitute—beyond the self-sufficient solipsism of solitary existence—communal ties of societal coexistence, the wealth of which, equally many-layered as the phenomenon itself, ranges from extensive examinations regarding the singularly concrete occurrence of inter-personal relationships, through thorough contemplations on the convolutions of the ir-reducible, un-deniable alterity of the other, to systematical conceptualizations of the ontologically integral and integrative, cogently universal elements of societies, of society as such, led, moreover, also, occasionally—as the renowned, in-famously ill-reputed “cases” of (the destinies of) personalities, such as Martin Heidegger, on the one hand, or, on the other hand, Jan Patočka demonstrate—with diametrically opposed, even tragically obfuscated repercussions, to the efforts of practical effectuations and political realizations of the “projects,” the “projections” of (the representatives of) the philosophical thought: phenomenology—within the countries of the Central and Eastern Europe, especially during the turbulent transitional processes of democratization—did, indeed, albeit merely as a minute part of the atmosphere of spiritual turmoil, help shape the paradoxically contradictory “image” of the 20th century.

Insofar as the movement of phenomenological philosophy is significantly co-determined by the elaboration of the multifarious facets of sociality, which—through the passage, and the impasses, of times, of places and of spaces re-tracing (out) the forever shifting accents and the evermore discerning nuances—connects its original inception with its transfigured instantiation within the 21st century, which, therefore, de-marks the entirety of its (self-revealing) histor(icity), the theme of the relation between phenomenology and sociality demands and deserves, always anew, with various voices again and again conceding to the conversation, a constantly re-iterated elucidation: a repetition: such is the purpose of the present publication.

The contributions collected under the title *Thinking Togetherness* (would like to) offer, each one from its own authorial perspective, detailed studies of distinguishing features inter-linking phenomenology and sociality that, rather than bridging beforehand the abyss of the in-between by stipulating the disposition of social phenomenology or of phenomenological sociology, above all, seek—as the conjunction of the subtitle suggests—to dis-close the denoted

relation itself, the proximities and the distances designated therethrough, as the openness of a question. Likewise, the headings of the seven separate sections, which organize the contents, the chapters of the book, attempt—with the usage of the dis-banding “and” between the two con-tested concepts con-noting the topic center—to articulate, instead of forcefully unifying the dis-similarity of debated standpoints, the dialogicality of (all) philosophical circumscription.*

The essays of the first section, “Presuppositions and Implications,” introductorily—in *nuce*—outline the main contours of the thematic scope of the whole. Whilst the second section, “Transcendentality and Intersubjectivity,” is altogether devoted to the discussion of Husserl’s insights that have been, and remain, an indispensable influence on the phenomenological comprehension of the social, the third, “Developments and Refinements,” focuses on some of his followers, students and successors, who never simply imitatively pursued the teacher’s thought, but, applying it also to novel provinces of reflection, approached, and reproached, it with self-critical earnestness. However, the outlook of the book is decidedly not directed strictly towards re-telling bygone accomplishments of the movement: the subsequent sections, “Collectivity and Community” as well as “Particularities and Totalitarities,” make manifest that the confrontation with the opulent tradition of phenomenology discovers its senseful pertinence for a requisite response to the exigencies of contemporary society, primarily perhaps to the alarming re-emergence of authoritarianism within the globalized world; in this respect, the (political) reverberations of Heidegger’s and of Hannah Arendt’s philosophical concerns necessitate cautious attention. If the experience of the work of art, at the heart of the section “Individuality and Expressivity,” promises the potentiality of

11

* The majority of the papers of the monograph were, in the form of first drafts, presented at The 6th Conference of the Central and East European Society for Phenomenology (CEESP), which was organized by the Institute Nova Revija for the Humanities (INR) and which took place under the title *Phenomenology and Sociality* as an online event on December 2–4, 2021. During the preparation of the book, however, prospective authors were additionally asked to substantiate the contributions in concordance with the conventions of academic scientificity. The videos of the lectures delivered at the conference are freely accessible at the YouTube channel of the INR: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=hthT0bir8AI&list=PLV6uJba1sev4Qs2hNheSGEz1RMEhohM-U>.

an anticipated alternative to the concerning, disconcerting realities today threatening the fragile fabric of human co-existence, the now pervasively encountered technological mediation, as the concluding chapters within the final section “Technologies and Controversies” seem to, without re-solution, propose, further confound the perplexities affecting prolific and peaceful conviviality among people(s).

12 The composition of the publication, hence, endeavors, by itself, to rend asunder and to render apparent, in a meaningful manner, the capacious intricacies of the panoramic mosaic of phenomenological re-cognition(s) of sociality. Insofar as the overwhelmingly disparate, ostensibly recently ever escalating—medical and military, migratory, economic and ecological—crises endanger (the certainty and the security of) the human(e) world, the im-permanence of the im-possibility of dwelling with others, together, the abundance of conclusions and of consequences that can be adduced from the access towards the social appertaining to phenomenology, tying—through the present—its past with its future, ensures not only succeeding and successful (academic) advancement of its research, but, hopefully, likewise contributes to the humanities, to the society of humanity as such. The gathered essays of the present book (would like to) attest, through the plenitude of portrayed topics and through the generational array of authors, to the liveliness, to the relevance of con-current phenomenological philosophy.

What does it mean, what does it *do*, then, now: to think togetherness?

★

The editor as well as the publisher of the collective monograph *Thinking Togetherness. Phenomenology and Sociality* would like to extend cordial gratitude for the kindness of generosity to all the scholars who graciously participated in the preparation of the book not only by cor-relating the benefit of exhaustive expertise, but also by offering to it, to us the patience—the heart—of humanity.

“The publication edited by Andrej Božič on *Thinking Togetherness. Phenomenology and Sociality* presents a novel and up-to-date account of phenomenology, which comprehends this philosophy as an essentially intersubjective or a communal enterprise; in the volume, phenomenology exceeds narrow limits of subjective life of consciousness, and focuses on various phenomena connected to the public, communal, and political spheres. [...] The book can serve both as a textbook in the heritage of the phenomenological movement and as a collection of original studies.”

Assoc. Prof. Dr. **Witold Płotka**

Institute of Philosophy, Cardinal Stefan Wyszyński University in Warsaw

“The comprehensive collection of contributions entitled *Thinking Togetherness. Phenomenology and Sociality* represents an important scientific achievement within the field of phenomenological philosophy. The monograph, the central topic of which is the elucidation of some of the essential dimensions of the social, was prepared, as already a simple glimpse over the table of contents reveals, in cooperation with an assemblage of authors from across the world. Such an international configuration of the whole composed of 32 chapters, meaningfully arranged into seven thematic sections, imparts upon the volume the character of an extensive and exhaustive, panoramic scrutiny of the phenomenological manner of confronting the question what constitutes the fundamental traits of interpersonal co-habitation with others. [...] *Thinking Togetherness. Phenomenology and Sociality*, therefore, not only offers a historical account with regard to the development of phenomenology, but also quite straightforwardly concerns its relevance within the philosophical research that deals with the contemporary problems of society.”

Assoc. Prof. Dr. **Sebastjan Vörös**

Department of Philosophy, University of Ljubljana

togetherness

thinking

INR | INSTITUTE NOVA REVIJA
FOR THE HUMANITIES

ISBN 978-961-7014-40-2



9 789617 014402